

# AFRICAN GAME LODGES AND RURAL INCOMES: SOME KEY SOUTHERN AFRICAN TRENDS

Peter John Massyn

14 October 2004

Julian Sturgeon's comments (from Resources Africa)

Page: 1

Do we have any quantitative analysis to support this assertion about strategic importance of ecotourism? How significant is the impact of ecotourism, given the reality of leakages?

Page: 1

Surely state agencies tend to hold onto biodiversity management and leave commercial development to the private sector – clarification please.

Page: 1

This is a significant issue. By what process did eg Rocktail and Ndumo deals end up so disadvantageously for the communities? Why was the bargaining ineffective? Are there lessons to be learnt here?

Page: 1

How is effective bargaining guaranteed? What can be done? By whom?

Page: 1

Is there a need for regulatory intervention? Are women being paid within statutory wage guidelines?

Page: 1

Is the affirmative procurement policy delivering benefits to local communities or simply to BEE companies that may be located outside the region?

Page: 1

Figures? Are there significant trends in comparing resource rentals to wage bills? What I understand is that wage bills constitute the biggest part of overall benefit streams. Can this change? Improve?

Page: 1

Is this not the most important lesson so far – namely that a structured set of access, equity and tenurial rights is a necessary but not sufficient condition for maximising returns to communities? Other conditions would be that a competitive set of natural

assets is present, and that the private sector partner is 'willing'. These last 2 cannot be guaranteed.

Page: 2

Surely there is a case for structuring lease and/or rental income by way of better structured community institutions? If a community is required to register its beneficiaries, and must pay a dividend to registered individuals, this can avoid conflict over control of the benefit stream. Have the fight about benefit rights in the board room and set up an agreement with the PS partner whereby rental payments are direct.

Page: 2

Re Madikwe: How does the state manage to avoid ceding rental payments to communities?

Page: 2

It is always important to note that hunting is often a significant contributor to community benefits. Although hunting does not enjoy a universally good reputation, it is generally true to say that it can pay the bills.

Page: 2

Is there potential to improve the performance of secondary enterprise? Would it be worth the effort to, say, promote product development in the craft industry?

#### KEY ISSUES:

1. How has it happened that partial/conditional rights have arisen; ie, that some communities end up with better rights than others? Resource rights provide a bargaining platform for communities. Did PJM look at lodges without community participation?
2. Have equity and access rights yielded optimal benefits to communities? Obviously they have improved the bargaining position of communities, but have they been fully exploited to the advantage of communities? It would seem to be that they have not. Can this be addressed, and how?
3. Brokerage? Is there a market-based role for a brokering function? NOT a donor-supported process, please!
4. Better community institutions? That can better manage the process of making deals? Does this mean more capacity building? Oh no...